Developing Authentic Assessment Rubric for Assessing 5th Grade Elementary School Students at Buleleng Regency

Luh Metri Sulistya Sudeni*, Putu Kerti Nitiasih, Luh Gd Rahayu Budiarta

Department of English Education, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha
Jl. Udayana No.11, Banjar Tegal, Singaraja, Kabupaten Buleleng, Bali, 81116, Indonesia
*corresponding author, e-mail: metrisulistya7@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengembangkan rubrik penilaian otentik dengan mengadopsi beberapa metode pembelajaran yang bersesuaian dengan pembelajaran abad ke-21 menggunakan model Desain dan Pengembangan disertai tahapan ADDE. Subjek dalam penelitian ini adalah guru dan siswa kelas 5 SD di Kabupaten Buleleng. Terdapat beberapa jenis instrumen yang diterapkan dalam mengumpulkan data, yaitu observasi, wawancara, kuesioner, dan analisis dokumen, selanjutnya dianalisis dengan mixed method analisis data. Dari keseluruhan pengujian atau proses evaluasi diperoleh bahwa rubrik yang telah dikembangkan dinyatakan sebagai rubrik penilaian yang sangat baik oleh tiga ahli dan satu guru penilai, serta dikatakan baik oleh satu hasil evaluasi guru. Dengan demikian dapat disimpulkan bahwa rubrik yang telah dikembangkan layak digunakan untuk menilai proses belajar mengajar Bahasa Inggris kelas 5 SD baik dari segi proses, kinerja, maupun produk yang dihasilkan.

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to develop an authentic assessment rubric by adopting several learning methods that are appropriate to 21st century learning using the Design and Development model accompanied by the ADDE stages. The subjects in this study were teachers and students of grade 5 elementary school in Buleleng Regency. Several instruments were applied in collecting data, including observations, interviews, questionnaires, and document analysis, which were then analyzed using mixed method data analysis. The rubric developed was declared very good by three experts and one teacher assessor; and good by one teacher’s evaluation results. Thus, it can be concluded that the rubric that has been developed is appropriate to be used to assess the teaching and learning process of 5th grade English in terms of process, performance, and the resulting product.
INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, the life change and development cannot be stopped due to the industrial revolution 4.0. This era is characterized by artificial intelligence that is widely applied throughout the fabric of people’s lives (Lase, 2019). In line with Lase (2019), there are many terms included in nowadays era, such as one’s thinking, perspective, and work. All of them have had a very significant influence, inclining the human education system (Lase, 2019). The education that is expected in this era is education that focuses on developing knowledge and skills. A country is said to be able to follow the industrial revolution 4.0 if it has succeeded in improving the quality of education in an effort to improve its human resources (Lase, 2019).

Oktaviani & Fauzan (2017) also said that a good and appropriate learning methods in classroom learning must be used by teachers as way to achieve good learning benefits for students. The teachers also must be able to deliver learning skills to the students. Several skills must be mastered by an English learner in this era of revolution 4.0, such as critical and creative thinking, also skills of communicating and collaborating, in addition to the ability to listen, read, speak, and write. Teachers are expected to be able to guide their students to be ready to face the future in the real world through learning classes. There is a need for improving teaching with better literacy and technology development (Angelianawati, 2019). According to Angelianawati (2019), teachers are expected to be able to become facilitators, prosecutors, and evaluators in the learning classroom.

Talking about the education in Indonesia, English is one of the learning subjects that is very much needed in the development of the country (Oktaviani & Fauzan, 2017). The English learning in Indonesia pays full attention to learning for young learners, one of which is for elementary school, as English will lead a child to become globally knowledgeable and literate about world issues (Oktaviani & Fauzan, 2017). A child’s language skills are in a very good development period when they are at the younger age. In this case, teachers also take a part in supporting good education with the demand to be a professional (Lase, 2019). The government fully regulates Indonesian education centrally from all aspects of education, including teaching staff, learning materials and methods, as well as student assessment processes (Churiyah & Sakdiyyah, 2020). Even though technology-based learning that is connected to the 21st century has been adopted, the inequality of the learning process still occurs. The unpreparedness of schools and educators is the main source of this education problem for children who have not been equally well distributed (Churiyah & Sakdiyyah, 2020). The development and improvement of the Education curriculum in Indonesia was also carried out from the KTSP curriculum to the 2013 curriculum, but it seems that this has not been effective in improving the education system. It makes the students unable to master the expected 21st century skills (Luciana, 2020).

In the other hand, the previous study also talked that proper assessment and method do not appear in online learning. In a bad world condition due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Indonesian government has launched a policy to carry out almost all sectors of life from home, including educational sector (Setiawan & Iasha, 2020). Schools with various levels in Indonesia implement an online learning system as an effort to stop the spread of the virus itself. In this online learning system, educators are required to be able to utilize technology well and display appropriate and innovative learning. Setiawan & Iasha (2020) revealed that the media that are mostly accessed and considered to facilitate the online learning process in Indonesia are WhatsApp groups, zoom meetings, telegram, and google classroom. Undoubtedly, smartphones and supporting applications are needed in carrying out learning classes, both by educators and students. A learning that can be done remotely by utilizing internet technology and electronic devices such as smartphones and notebooks to connect teachers and students to carry out learning is online learning.

The learning system is no longer conventional, unlike the offline learning. Yet, in fact, the teachers do not yet have good enough innovation in presenting online learning classes for the convenience of their students. With the new learning system, the teacher is still groping to find the appropriate learning method. The teachers have some obstacles to control students’ learning process and assessment (Burdina et al., 2019). Those should be authentic but are still not. If these cases are allowed to continue, the teaching and learning process, especially English, will never
improve. Moreover, in terms of the learning assessment process, teachers often do not provide authentic assessments and evaluations, there is no clear assessment process and rubric, and there is no feedback that can build and introspect students’ abilities as a whole. Teacher exclusively provides an assessment of the student’s learning outcomes without looking at the processes and efforts done by the students to complete a lesson. Online classes also will never be at the maximum level to provide comfortable distance learning. The obstacles to learning English and the assessment process are the same as the other online learning. Besides, technically, signals are often an obstacle, and teachers find it very difficult to control the process optimally for his students (Nartiningrum & Nugroho, 2020).

As stated by, several challenges are faced by teachers and students when carrying out the online assessment process, such as inadequate signals and difficulties in using technology for users who have just learned to use technology, especially those who are still in elementary school (Surahman & Wang, 2022; Yulianto & Mujtahid, 2021). Signals often hinder student activity in learning in the classroom. In the worst cases, students do not carry out their obligations on time due to the Internet connection and other factors beyond the control and supervision of teachers because they take place online. In addition, the assessment is also sometimes considered not authentic enough to be applied. Assessment should be attempted to be able to provide feedback to improve students’ abilities, but in reality, not all have been met. Teachers have not been able to provide online assessments that develop students’ metacognitive abilities. In addition, teachers will find it difficult to comprehend the real ability of the students; due to technical problems, some appear to be less involved, or some get good evaluation results because they are assisted by friends or parents. Therefore, sometimes, online assessment results cannot 100% guarantee students’ abilities. Teachers also cannot monitor student performance in full and in control (Surahman et al., 2021).

We can do several things to cope with all the aforementioned problems. First, in terms of appropriate and supportive learning methods, several learning methods are very appropriate to use in learning in this revolutionary era of 4.0. Among them is Problem-Based Learning (Padang, 2020) argued that combining metacognitive and cognitive learning in the form of learning that trains students to solve a problem in order to gain knowledge and understanding is called problem-based learning. This learning can provide benefits as a result of the integration process that takes place between knowledge and skills itself (Padang, 2020). The second is Project-Based Learning which can train students cognitive well with students as a learning center to solve various problems through a project, students will be trained in their independence and skills in the learning process, and without a doubt, they will be able to do a good collaboration (Padang, 2020). The next is Discovery Learning. This learning method can help teachers provide authentic learning for their students, where students are trained to acquire knowledge independently with a constructive learning process through testing and investigation activities that involve inductive reasoning (Sofeny, 2017). Last but not least is Task-Based Learning. By doing a task from the teacher, this method can help students to develop language skills; of course, the material provided has a close relationship with everyday life (Yildiz & Senel, 2017). According to Yildiz & Senel (2017), several stages must be done in applying this learning method, including pre-task, where students will be invited to identify the topic of the task and learning that will be given.

After carrying out the learning process, there is a need for an assessing process of the learning process and student learning outcomes. The expected assessments are in the form of authentic assessment. According to Aziz et al. (2020), this assessment is a professional form of assessment accompanied by a learning experience that is similar to the real situation in the field both in terms of critical thinking, communicating, working in groups, and acting in groups. Creativity means students are encouraged to be more active so that indirectly they can develop their social skills. In other words, the assessment is not only a matter of score but also a process, which in this case is the implementation of an authentic assessment of the student's English learning process and, of course, appropriate learning methods in the classroom.

Herdiawan & Java (2017) reveals that most teachers do not understand well the procedures for implementing the right authentic assessment, even though authentic assessment is very
appropriate to be used in an interactive teaching and learning process. Assessing with authentic assessment is not like traditional assessment which usually asks students to match statements or choose multiple choices (Herdiawan & Java, 2017). Authentic assessment strongly considers a sustainable assessment system by covering all aspects that are improving innovative aspects (Herdiawan & Java, 2017). Herdiawan & Java (2017) stated that an authentic assessment must contain five dimensions of assessment: social context, physical context, task assessment, criteria assessment, and outcome and form assessment. All of these dimensions are needed to assess the learning process that is not only oriented to intellectual abilities but also related to the skills needed in the 21st century and metacognition. In the previous study by Marhaeni & Kusuma (2017) are five types of assessment that are generally used in the field of teaching and learning process such as self-assessment, project assessment, product assessment, and performance assessment. Therefore, research related to the developing of authentic assessment rubric with proper learning method will be carried out.

A guide used by educators as a reference in evaluating student learning outcomes and performance is the rubric (Chowdhury, 2018). Standards and criteria are two fundamental things that compose a rubric (Venera, 2017). Standards are certain levels that must be achieved in a lesson, while criteria refer to all forms of things that will be evaluated in a learning process (Venera, 2017). As an effort to realize effective and authentic learning, the use of authentic assessment in assessing students is the right way. In its application, a teacher must pay attention to several things related to the assessment rubric used. An authentic assessment rubric must explicitly display clear assessment criteria and undoubtedly able to help improve students' learning abilities (Ulen, 2010). An authentic assessment rubric must consist of appropriate directors and can direct students to appropriate learning methods and strategies (Ulen, 2010).

There are three objectives of this research, first to recognize the criteria for designing English authentic assessment rubrics for assessing 5th grade elementary school students in Buleleng regency. The second to develop the proper English authentic assessment rubrics for assessing 5th grade elementary school students in Buleleng regency. The last to recognize the qualities of the authentic assessment rubrics development for EFL teachers in 5th grade elementary school students at Buleleng Regency

METHOD

Research design

This study conducted by using Design and Development method. Design and development (DnD) is a pragmatic research methodology aiming at creating empirically instructional and non-instructional tools and products with systematic studies that make efforts in the design, development, and evaluation stages. This research developed the instructional product following several stages, including analysis, design, development, and evaluation.

Setting and participations

The research took place in SD Laboratorium Undiksha Singara and SD N 3 Banjar Jawa. These schools are two of the model schools in Buleleng regency. They have a good learning system. Both schools also applied Curriculum 2013. So, the researchers chose this school as a research setting, which can later be used as a reference and direction for learning English with a good assessment and can be a role model for other schools.

Data collection method and analysis

There are several stages in this research; each stage has its instrument and method for collecting data. In the first stage, namely the analysis stage, the researcher carried out the process of collecting and analyzing data by observing and interviewing. After obtaining data from observations and interviews, the next stage is designing the rubric. The development phase of the assessment rubric is the most fundamental. At the development stage, the data were analyzed using a checklist of expert judgment to see the feasibility of the product. The last stage, namely evaluation, is the evaluation of the results of the effectiveness test from experts and teachers.

Overall, the data obtained in numbers were then analyzed quantitatively, while other data obtained during interviews and observations were processed qualitatively. The data obtained from expert judgment were then analyzed quantitatively by adopting the formula from
Table 1. The measurement formula adapted from Nurkancana & Sunartana (1992)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( X \geq M_i + 1.5 \sigma_i )</td>
<td>Excellent Rubric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( M_i + 0.5 \sigma_i \leq X &lt; M_i + 1.5 \sigma_i )</td>
<td>Good Rubric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( M_i - 0.5 \sigma_i \leq X &lt; M_i + 0.5 \sigma_i )</td>
<td>Average Rubric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( M_i - 1.5 \sigma_i \leq X &lt; M_i - 0.5 \sigma_i )</td>
<td>Below Average Rubric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( X &lt; M_i - 1.5 \sigma_i )</td>
<td>Poor Rubric</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RESULT**

The interview found that the teachers encounter many challenges in the teaching and learning process, both technical constraints from signals and internet data as well as obstacles from internal students who are still young learners. Teachers often find it hard to manage their students. Students quickly feel bored and are reluctant to follow the class well, even though the teachers believe they have provided the interesting learning. The learning that took place does not apply any learning methods related to 21st century learning skills in both schools, so that this resulted in teachers being less able to conduct learning that was more varied, fun, and meet the needs of students. The teachers also mean that they have not maximized 21st century skills learning to the maximum. In the learning process, the teacher reveals to keep trying cooperative learning even though it is not optimal. They are more result oriented than process oriented. The learning carried out by the teacher tends to provide only material and assignments.

The assessments carried out are only in the form of assignments and tests and rarely provide projects such as video and audio. The teachers have not been able to carry out the authentic assessment process. No specific criteria could be used as a reference for assigning a grade scale to students. The teachers only gave an assessment by guessing and seeing the results of the assignment at a glance, unless the test given was multiple choice. It is necessary to have more authentic learning methods and assessment rubrics to improve the quality of teaching and learning.

The questionnaire results also indicate that both elementary schools in Buleleng Regency do not yet have appropriate assessment criteria and instruments to be used for assessing the students’ teaching and learning processes. Even though the lesson plans have shown conformity with the curriculum and syllabus used, in reality, they still need improvement and quality improvement. It is also necessary to add and develop learning methods and assessment instruments that are in accordance with student activities and learning processes. From those results, the researcher found that the development of the authentic assessment rubric is a must. Several stages need to be prepared, such as the criteria, proper learning method, and proper assessment types that are in accordance with the learning syllabus and curriculum. They also need to be in line with ADDE stages.

In the process of designing the rubric, the researcher adopted the syntax from the learning methods that are in accordance with nowadays learning in this 21st century era. It was done to make the structured learning processes and appropriate learning assessment for the students. The syntax of the learning method adopted were from problem-based learning, project-based learning, task-based language learning, and discovery learning. Those syntax guided the researcher to develop the assessment rubric in accordance with course’s syllabus, learning aims, supported by proper learning sources, and completed by comparison table and analysis that can help the teachers assess the students in the appropriate ways. The more detail syntax in each learning method is elaborated as follows.

1. In applying problem-based learning method, several stages must be carried out, namely elaborating a problem so that a joint investigation can then be carried out and the teacher acts as a facilitator. After the investigation is complete, students can examine if the appropriate
method is used to conduct an investigation of a problem, and in the end, students can write an investigation report. After that, the teacher will help evaluate the results of the investigation together with the students. In the end, the independence, communication, and good thinking of students will be trained by the application of this method (Hadi & Izzah, 2019).

2. The project-based learning method consists of several stages, namely preparation to introduce students to a topic before working on a project; planning, where students are invited to make project plans and design projects; researching, where students work on a project, either individually or in groups, after the design is complete; conclusion drawing, where students are trained to conclude the results of their work; making a presentation on the work that had been done; and doing evaluation of the work. It is at this stage that the students will be given direction and input on the results of their work (Gulmez & Ortaokulu, 2018).

3. The five syntaxes of discovery based learning method according to Sarimanah et al. (2019) are:
   a) Orientation
      Orientation is the initial stage, given to students in order to analyze and train students' critical thinking skills about a problem. At this stage, an initial description of a phenomenon will be given so that it can later be connected with the knowledge that has been possessed. At this stage, the teacher can observe students' abilities.
   b) Generation Hypothesis
      At this stage, students are trained to be able to carry out a hypothesis by training the ability to analyze, interpret, and evaluate students. All forms of information obtained in the previous stage will have an impact at this stage, where students formulate hypotheses related to the problem.
   c) Hypothesis Testing
      After going through the hypothesis generation stage, the next stage is hypothesis testing. At this stage, there are trials and tests that must be carried out for a proof. Later, students will obtain data and present the results of the experiment. This stage will train students to be able to organize, analyze, and evaluate.
   d) Conclusion
      Here the students are trained to be able to conclude and evaluate a finding from an experiment that answers a hypothesis. At this stage, a hypothesis is determined, whether or not it is in accordance with the facts found. At this stage, the hypothesis can be corrected or replaced with a new one.
   e) Regulation
      After the experiment results are obtained by students, the next step is a confirmation from the teacher to find out the truth of the findings and conclusions. By all means, at this stage, the teacher carries out supervision and guidance to his students, and certainly does not escape the evaluation stage.

4. The theory by Rodr (2010) describes the stages that are involved in the task-based language learning. Among them are Pre-Task, Task Cycle, and Language Focus. At the pre-task stage, the teacher provides introductions to students related to the topics to discuss and study; the teacher identifies the topic and seeks to explore students' prior knowledge relating to phrases and words relevant to the topic with the hope of motivating students to perform the assigned task. Then, it is at this stage of the task cycle that students do the real tasks under the teacher's observation. Students are directed to work collaboratively in pairs or groups. At this stage, the teacher is also expected to be able to act as a facilitator and provide constructive input for students. Students will be directed to how to present the results of their assignments and convey conclusions. Then, the last stage is language focus. At this stage, emphasis is placed on the language used in carrying out each stage to analyze and use an analysis feature. Furthermore, the evaluation conducted with the participation of the three experts and two teachers to perceive the quality of the product developed, of which results are presented in Table 2.
Table 2. Total Score of Expert Judgements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Judges</th>
<th>Scores</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Expert 1</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Expert 2</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Expert 3</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Teacher 1</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Teacher 2</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the table above, it can be seen that four scores categorize the rubric as excellent rubric, which is from experts 1, 2, 3, and also teacher 1. On the other hand, the score from teacher 2 indicates that the rubric is good. So, it can be inferred that the assessment rubric was proper to use.

**DISCUSSION**

**The Criteria Of Authentic Assessment Rubric for 5th grade students**

According to Joshi et al. (2020), online assessment has many benefits for various parties in the field of education; for students, this assessment can provide greater flexibility so that students can work faster and easier without being constrained by space and time and can even reach remote areas at any time. According to Chowdhury (2018), in compiling an authentic assessment rubric, several criteria must be considered, including a description of student assignments which must be clear and detailed regarding what things must be carried out by students and of course must be adapted to the syllabus and learning curriculum used in grade 5 SD. In addition, a good rubric is a rubric that has a clear rating scale to determine the level of student assessment, for example proficient, competent, partially competent, not yet competent, and beginner. A rubric must also have clear dimensions so that students can complete tasks according to the components of skills and achievements to be achieved. Dimensions must be accompanied by a description of the dimensions to comprehend the students' performance in working on the given dimensions. Dimension should be followed by the description of dimension to make the structured work of students; the description will help the students to work based on what is expected to be reached in the learning processes.

**The development of authentic assessment rubric**

The observation results shown that English is not the major learning material in the school and has big possibility to be deleted. Students were taught only by one English teacher for all stages or several stages in one school, who lack ability to teach English in a properly various way, and make the students in those elementary schools seemed uninterested and unmotivated to learn. The teacher also did not apply the appropriate learning method for the proper English learning activity. The teachers were unable to provide authentic assessments and evaluations; they have unclear assessment and lack feedback that can build and introspect students' abilities as a whole. From these findings, we can see generally that the teachers in primary school in Buleleng Regency have not implemented appropriate learning methods in the classroom in order to obtain the benefits of a good teaching and learning process. The assessment system carried out also does not meet the standards of a good and authentic assessment process. The researcher used the data found to support the development of an authentic assessment rubric.

The rubric development process begins with the analysis of the data from the observation and interview in both schools (SD N 3 Banjar Jawa and SD Laboratorium Undiksha). The interview result show that the teachers did not use the specific assessment rubric and criteria; the teacher only focused on the students learning result and product. There were no authentic guidelines for teachers and students. The teachers have tried to apply the collaborative learning and innovative task such as video or audio recording but appeared to be ineffective. The documents observation results found that both schools apply Curriculum 2013 and the syllabus is in accordance with it. On the other hand, based on the observation, the students' lesson plan still needs improvement in terms of the students' activities and learning methods. Based on the data found in the syllabus
analysis, the product will be developed for one semester of English learning, that include four main themes.

The second stage is designing a blueprint that is adapted to the learning syllabus. Activities are adjusted to the material to be discussed and the methods used. In addition, the blueprint also states the right type of assessment that can be used in accordance with student learning activities. After the blueprint is designed, the researcher can start the development stage by developing a rubric draft. The developed rubric draft contains grading criteria that are adjusted to the syntax of each learning method and the scale used to assess. In addition, the type of assessment used is also adjusted to the learning topic, activity, and syntax of the method used. Furthermore, the draft of this rubric is consulted with the supervisor to receive revisions and input. The next stage is to develop a rubric based on the results of the revision. At this stage, the rubric is developed in a more structured manner, starting with determining the learning method to be adopted, determining the topic and sub-topic of the material that will be used as a reference for the types of activities that students do, developing teacher’s direction to make it easier for teachers to convey learning activities to students, developing the whole stage activities that are in accordance with the syntax of the learning method, determining the type of assessment that is adapted to the stage of activities, developing a self-assessment of the product and student performance. After the rubric is completed in its entirety and declared final, it is time to conduct an evaluation. The evaluation involved three experts and two teachers to see the validity of the products. The result shows that the rubric is "excellent" by the three experts and one teacher; and "good" by one teacher.

The authentic assessment rubric makes it easier for teachers to assess student learning outcomes (Reynolds-Keefer, 2010). In addition, it can guide students to learn independently. Students can realize what they need to understand from each subject matter (Benson et al., 2022). Students can measure their learning progress at any time. So that learning achievement targets can be more easily monitored by teachers, parents and even students themselves. In its development, authentic assessment rubrics can be developed both in print and online, even through the application of the learning assessment system (Ulfa et al., 2019). Rubrics can be designed through a factual notification approach to remind students about their learning targets and progress.

CONCLUSION

This research aimed to know the criteria for designing authentic assessment rubrics for 5th-grade elementary school students. The rubric is the fundamental instrument needed by the teacher to make a structured and authentic assessment. When creating the rubric, there are several criteria to be followed, such as the description of student assignments. In addition, a good rubric is a rubric that has a clear rating scale to determine the level of student assessment. A rubric must also have clear dimensions so that students can complete tasks according to the components of skills and achievements to be achieved. Dimension should be followed by the description of dimension to make the structured work of students. The second aim of this study is to know how to develop an authentic assessment rubric for 5th-grade elementary school students. The development started by analyzing the supporting data needed such as finding out the information about the curriculum and syllabus used, after that start to design the blueprint of the product based on the analysis stage result, it can be started by making the blueprint of the product. When the blueprint is finished, it can be started to develop the product completed with the fundamental elements such as proper learning activities and assessment type that is in accordance with basic competencies, indicators, and syntax of the learning method used. The last step is evaluation, the researcher used expert judgments to see the validity of the product. Those show that the product is very good and good, it means that the product was well developed and proper to be applied.

From the research results, it is hoped that in the future, teachers can make adjustments and improve the quality of learning through the application of authentic assessment rubrics in the classroom. Educational institutions are also expected to be able to provide training related to the use of authentic assessment so that they are better able to prepare more qualified educators. For other researchers, it is hoped that in the future they will be able to make improvements to the
research carried out, for example by making activities that are more varied in the products developed and increasing the focus of learning themes in each semester used.

REFERENCES


Sofeny, D. (2017). The Effectiveness of discovery learning in improving English writing skills of extroverted and introverted students. *Jurnal Penelitian Humaniora, 18*(1), 41-46. [https://doi.org/10.23917/humaniora.v18i1.3639](https://doi.org/10.23917/humaniora.v18i1.3639)


