A Comparative Study of Junior and Senior High School ELT textbook

Isnaeni Martha Fadhila
University of Singaperbangsa Karawang

ABSTRACT

This study aims to analyze female characters’ visibility by comparing two junior high school textbooks (VII and IX) and two senior high school English textbooks (X and XII). This research used social context parameters such as (1) family (2) occupations (3) school participation and achievement, and (4) hobbies and interests. The findings show some differences between female and male characters in the texts and illustrations in JHS and SHS ELT textbooks. The result found there are some significant differences in female representation in the ELT textbooks for JHS and SHS.

A. INTRODUCTION

Gender is one of the particular socio-cultural issues that is shaped in textbooks, especially in ELT material (Ahour & Zaferani, 2016). The issues of gender equality or inequality have been of great interest in education in the last few years, especially in multi-cultural and multi-religious such as Indonesia. In social practice, gender differences appear in every society's social behaviors.

In society, men and women are sometimes portrayed differently. In multicultural and multi-religious Asian societies such as Indonesia, gender stereotype is often found in many activities such as daily basis activity, job, and education. In terms of achievement and social achievement, women and men are considered to have differences. The description of women and men can describe their beliefs and attitudes.

* Corresponding author.
E-mail addresses: marthafadhila.edu@gmail.com (Isnaeni Martha Fadhila)
Men are generally perceived to be in a higher position than women. Men’s activities are considered more precious than women’s, even though the activities are similar (Lorber, 2007). Such beliefs about women and men reflect stereotyped beliefs Cusack (2013) describes a gender stereotype as a generalized view or preconception about attributes or characteristics that are or ought to be possessed by women and men or the roles that are or should be performed by men and women. It can be both positive and negative, for example, “women are nurturing” or “women are weak”. Women are also generally described as dependent and passive. Furthermore, they are believed to be interested in gossip, fashion, and shopping. On the contrary, men are markedly defined by opposite characteristics to women, such as being independent and active. These beliefs are then called gender stereotypes. Gender stereotypes consist of several components: personal traits, social roles, behavior, and physical characteristic (appearance) (Lips, 2003). Complete explanations about gender stereotypes are provided as follows:

1) Personal Traits

Female personality traits are caring, nurturing, affectionate, feminine, gentle, motherly, mature, warm, loving, friendly, and attractive (Aryani, (2013)). These personality traits are illustrated by female appearances with children in printed media. They are depicted as the ones who teach children new things, help children do their school work, cook for the whole family, and take care of babies. Other stereotypical female personality traits are unconfident (Emilia, Moecharam & Syifa, (2017)), unambitious, emotional, passive, dependent, incompetent (Kortenhaus & Demares, 1993), introvert, affluent, and less intellectually gifted (Lewandowsky, 2014), and silent (Barton & Sakwa, 2012). This is affirmed by the fact that all female characters are illustrated with others, never by themselves. In terms of facing problems, female characters are depicted to need help, usually from males, to solve their problems. In some stories, they ran away from their problems.

2) Social Roles

In social roles, females have roles as the caregivers of the families (Otlowski, 2002; Hodaj, 2015), providers of services (Esen, 2014), and the ones that are influenced by the decision taken by males (Shoeman, 2003). In domestic spheres, Females, different from their counterparts, are portrayed as doing chores indoors such as cooking, washing, mending, shopping, sewing, doing dishes, ironing, and taking care of the children.

In the occupational roles, Males are depicted as having a wider range of jobs in politics, laws, education, agriculture, sports, entertainment, and many more ( Sari, 2011; Barton & Sakwa;
As for females, their occupations are extensions of their traditional roles (Balfour, 2003; Karima, 2017), and the range is limited to nurture, service, and support-related professions (Esen, 2014; Seker & Dincer, 2014; Islam and Asadullah, 2018), not to mention that they have low social and economic rank jobs that are not paid as well as males’ (Mustedanajic, 2010; Lee & Collins, 2010). The studies' results reveal that those are the reason why most females are illustrated to work as teachers, nurses, clerks, receptionists, secretaries, maids, singers, and dancers.

3) Physical Characteristics

The physical characteristics most associated with athletic women are muscular, good body, strong, aggressive, and masculine; similarly, athletic men are muscular, healthy, strong, in shape, and good body. Good figure, long hair, good dresser, nail polish, and pretty face are mostly associated with sexy women, while macho men are related to muscular, hairy chest, mustache, attractive, and self-centered.

On the other hand, the physical characteristics of businesswomen are related to being smart, nice clothes, hard-working, and organized; businessmen are associated with wearing suits, smart, and good appearance (Crawford & Unger, 2004). It seems that women do share similar characteristics with men yet continued to be subjugated as men possess more qualities that are defining of their masculinity.

Van Leeuwen’s Theory of Social Practice

Van Leeuwen (2008) defines social practices as “socially regulated ways of doing things”. The crucial elements of social practices are (1) actions, (2) performance modes (specific ways of how actions are performed), (3) actors, and (4) presentation styles (how actors present themselves, e.g., dress, grooming, etc.), (5) times, (6) spaces, (7) resources (specific tool and material needed), and (8) eligibility (specific qualities of the concrete elements of social practices).

Number research about visual images and gender representation related to EFL textbooks analysis or evaluation Ariyanto (2018), and Setyono (2018) in Indonesia shows unequal representation
from both male and female characters. To validate these findings, the present study aims to examine female visibility in English language textbooks from a gender role perspective. This study aims to fill the gap in the representation of female character visibility in language textbooks in social contexts such as families, professions, engagement and success in education, and hobbies and interests. Although there are so many studies that have been conducted in the analysis of the gender representation of female characters in textbooks this study aims to be more focused on social contexts and the comparison between the junior high school and senior high school English textbooks.

B. METHOD

This study is a qualitative study that uses critical discourse analysis to examine female representation in the comparison of Indonesian EFL textbooks for junior high school students and senior high school students. A general quantitative analysis of gender representation was carried out by counting the number of females and males portrayed in the textbooks. It is important to note that only verbal and visual texts representing female characters were analyzed in this study. The representativeness of women was examined by analyzing female characters’ visibility by comparing the two junior high school textbooks and two senior high school English textbooks. This research used social context parameters such as (1) family, (2) occupations, (3) school participation and achievement, (4) hobbies, and (5) interests. The contextual parameters in this research are chosen because it shows how female characters were stereotypically portrayed in the textbooks that are used in this research. To guide this research, the author adopted the theory of social practice proposed by Van Leeuwen (2008) that embraces the following elements: ‘actions,’ ‘performance modes,’ ‘presentation styles,’ ‘location,’ and ‘eligibility condition’.

In this research, two junior high school textbooks (grade VII and IX) and two senior high school English textbooks (grade X and XII) are used for the research. The textbook for junior high school students is entitled: Bahasa Inggris: When English Rings a Bell Kelas VII and Bahasa Inggris: Think Globally Act Locally Kelas IX. Meanwhile, for the Senior High School entitled: Bahasa Inggris Untuk SMA/MA/SMK/MAK Kelas X and Bahasa Inggris Untuk SMA/MA/SMK/MAK Kelas XII. These textbooks were published by the Indonesia Ministry of Education and Culture. The textbooks were selected because these textbooks are particularly used in Indonesian junior high school and senior high school. It is also designed based on the 2013 National Curriculum for junior and senior high schools in Indonesia.
The Author manually recorded the number of gendered characters in each lesson unit (chapter) in the textbook. The Author selected both verbal and visual texts depicting female characters' presence in the form of dialogs and informational bubbles, instruction statements, and other texts. The Author also selected verbal texts showcasing the social roles that female characters play. The data was analyzed on several aspects of gender, which are often represented in the textbooks. The aspects are:

1. The Author counted the number of female/male pictures or illustrations in both junior and high school English textbooks.
2. The Author counted female characters who involve family context or domestic roles in both junior and high school English textbooks.
3. The Author counted female characters who involve professional/occupational roles in both junior and high school English textbooks.
4. The Author counted female characters that involve School Participation and Achievement roles in junior and high school English textbooks.
5. The Author counted female characters that involve Relation to hobbies and Interests in both junior and high school English textbooks.
6. Female or male mentioned includes proper noun, pronoun, a common noun, and title. The writer counted female/male, which is mentioned in both junior and high school English textbooks.
7. Female/male role models: the role models presented in texts, illustrations, or exercises. The role models presented in both junior and high school English textbooks were counted.
8. Female/male activities refer to female or male activities in both junior and high school English textbooks, such as shopping, driving, studying, working, and others were counted.

C. RESEARCH FINDING

Based on an analysis of two junior high school textbooks (grade VII and XI) and two senior high school English textbooks (grade X and XII) several findings have been found. The textbooks were analyzed in several aspects of gender namely female or male pictorial representation or illustration, emphasized the visibility of female characters in the two textbooks in which we used these social context parameters: (1) family, (2) occupations, (3) school participation and achievement, and (4) hobbies and interests. It is crucial to keep in mind that the focus of this research was only on texts depicting female visibility that were of the Author’s analytical focus.
Occurrences of Female and Male Characters in Texts and Illustrations in Junior High School and Senior High School textbooks

The quantitative investigation of female and male characters in the content of Junior and Senior High School English Textbooks resulted in immense distinctions between the numbers of female and male occurrences. The proportion of male characters in Senior High School English textbooks (25%) is higher than that of Junior High School English textbooks (21%). Meanwhile, the proportion of female characters in Junior High School English textbooks (29%) is higher than that of Senior High School English textbooks (25%).

Visual Images / Illustration Representation

In terms of visual representation, images or pictures in the textbook examined are analyzed. In determining whether the picture is female or male, we see the context. The table shows the frequency of male and female characters in visual or illustration representation in each Junior and Senior High School English textbook. It reveals that male representation is higher than female representation in both Junior and Senior High School English textbooks. Besides that, the table also shows that there is a comparison between the representation of men and women in the English textbooks for JHS and SHS. The frequency of male representation in the Senior High School English textbooks is higher than in Junior English Textbooks than in the Senior High School English textbooks. Meanwhile, the frequency of female representation is higher in the Junior English Textbooks than in the Senior High School English textbooks. In other words, in junior high school English books there is more gender bias which is quite significant compared to Senior high school English books.

1) The Portrayal of Female Characters in the family context

In the textbook examined, female’s activity in social & family aspects is more varied than that of males. In Junior High School textbooks the portrayal of female characters is the highly stereotypical way such as doing domestic activities and dealing with home-related activities.

GRADE | MALE | FEMALE
--- | --- | ---
7 JHS | 245 | 202
9 JHS | 162 | 160
TOTAL JHS | 407 | 362
10 SHS | 55 | 37
12 SHS | 33 | 50
TOTAL SHS | 88 | 87
TOTAL BOTH | 495 | 449
The first picture along with a dialogue text (on the left) in the seven grade of ELT Junior high school textbook and the second picture (on the right side) in the nine grade of ELT Junior high school textbook shows the portrayal of women and a girl of doing home-related activities as a sociocultural space. In the situation in the first picture, Siti greets her mother before she goes to school in the morning and her mother prepares a dish for their breakfast. It seems that Siti is going to help her mother prepare a dish for breakfast. She is supposed to do this routine cooking chore. This indicates that a woman or a girl is socioculturally assigned to play a traditionally feminine role, such as doing domestic chores in the kitchen.

The second picture shows a conversation between Siti and Dayu. In the blurb conversation in the picture, it seems that Siti asked what Dayu is doing. We can assume that Dayu in their conversation has just finished mopping the floor. In this sociocultural space, women or girls should be familiar with and capable of using cooking utensils or domestic activities as semiotic artifacts to perform domestic chores. Unconsciously, this thing is lead to a separation of domestic-related activities between the interest or responsibilities of men (boys) and women (girls) at home. Socio-cultural values that exist in Indonesia affect the perspective of women that exist in a society that a good woman is a woman who likes to do household chores. The stereotype that exists in society often makes some women doubt their capability in pursuing their dreams. In addition, in the ELT Senior High School textbooks, there is no portrayal of female characters in a family context found in the textbooks.

2) Female representation at work (occupation)

In the context of social role female’s activity, role, and occupation in professional aspect are more varied in the SHS ELT textbooks than in Junior High School ELT textbooks. In the Junior High School ELT textbooks, females tend to represent work in a job that involves patience, nurturing, service, and support such as housewives, teachers, school principals, and surgeons. The
following data (see Fig. 2) are from a seven-grade JHS ELT textbook (left) and a nine-grade JHS ELT textbook (right) showing a conversation text between a teacher (Miss Mutia) and her students (Beni, Dayu, Lisa, Udin, and Edo). In this conversation, the teacher is asking about what students’ parents do. As seen in the conversation, the female character is identified as a housewife and as a surgeon. Women are seen as taking a traditionally feminine role as a housewife. In this social role, being a housewife or a home keeper, a woman does a range of domestic chores, such as caring for children, cooking, doing dishes/laundry, ironing, cleaning, and buying for family needs. This shows that being a housewife is an identity of women that is formed from the socio-culture in the society.

Meanwhile, the second picture shows another side of women that women can also become leaders in their communities. The text shows a girl who described the need to see her school principal. The word “her” in this text indicates that her school principal is a woman. She also mentions that her school principal was having a meeting and we can assume that the school principal was leading the meeting. Based on this evidence, it depicts that women can also lead a team or a community and break the stereotype that women should be able to handle all domestic roles.

On the other hand, the ELT Senior High School textbooks represented various professional occupations in the textbooks. As in the following data below, the first picture (top) in the ten-grade English textbook shows that there is a representative picture of a famous female singer and a famous male soccer player person who is famous. They are described as one of the best in their respective fields. In this picture, the author seems to describe that women can also be professional singers in the entertainment industry.

Meanwhile, in the second picture, there is a picture of a Mayor in Surabaya. A reported text noted that Tri Rismaharini (TR), a Mayor of Surabaya City which also known as one of the most
charismatic leaders in Indonesia. In the photograph, we can see that TR appears together with a regional recycling conference committee (mostly men) as can be seen in the following figure (bottom). Based on the text, described that she hosted the Regional Recycling Conference (RRC). Together with the RRC attendees, TR inspected the display of toy motorcycles made from recycled parts. The smiling faces of both the conference participants and T indicate a joyful atmosphere in the conference venue. This picture helps to construct a better image of the woman portrayed in the ELT textbooks. It can be helped the traditional perceptions about women’s competencies. Stereotypically, women are viewed as incompetent, emotional, and unqualified. They deserved to do only domestic jobs. In contrast to this, TR shows that she is a competent, rational, professional, and assertive leader capable of changing Surabaya to become one of the most modern cities in Indonesia.

To influence the awareness of Senior High school students on gender equality and equality, the inclusion of reading text about a woman leader in the textbook has been a good decision. This can help provide an idea to high school students especially women, that many types of work can be done by women, one of which is becoming a mayor. Without realizing it, this will affect their mindset that women also have the same rights as men in achieving their dreams.
efforts that it is no wonder that Dayu always gets good grades because of her effort in studying. It also showcases female characters’ diligence in their school participation and achievement.

In another figure, there is a teacher and a female student named Lina who is standing in front of the class information to all students in the classroom about Lina's achievement in the winning story-telling competition. Lina also will be representing in class for the next story-telling competition in her school. This indicates that the female student in this class is considered to be more able to perform well in the story-telling competition than male students. In addition, the two examples of visual images and text in the JHS English textbooks above, can be depicted that academic achievements are dominated by the female in school.

On the other hand, the ELT Senior High School textbooks represented various school participation and achievements of women. The textbook, not only described women’s achievements in the English subject but also the other subject such as math. As presented in the first figure (top) in the tenth-grade ELT SHS textbook, there is a conversation between Rani, Anisa, and Mr. Sultoni who congratulated Rani who winning the math Olympiad. This shows that Rani is one of the smartest students in the field of mathematics at school. It can be observed that in the textbook female students are portrayed to perform better in school than male students.
Fig 5. Female representation in school participation and achievement in SHS textbook

In the SHS ELT textbooks, women are not only described as performing very well in school but they also portray women’s achievements in other fields. To give an overview to students about women’s achievement, the author of the textbook also put a reading text comprehension about a national female hero as in the figure above (on the left side). The text is about the biography of Cut Nyak Dien which known as a female leader of the Acehnese guerrilla forces during the Aceh War. Cut Nyak Dhien is described as a powerful woman who could lead Aceh guerilla during Aceh War. She also had educational experience, but the writer did not mention her institution.

Women are also depicted as being able to compete in a professional setting as presented in the right picture. In the English book for grade 12, there is an example of a job application letter belonging to Lilis Handayani. She was applying for a local branch manager position at Jeans and Co company. Based on the text she also claimed that she was also working as a manager on a local national shoe retailer companion in her previous job. As we know that managing a national company needs more responsibilities to lead the team to achieve company targets. Lilis also mentioned that she can work in a high-pressure, team environment, and she also mentioned that she was able to use some computer programs as her skill on her job application letter. This indicates that Lilis described as a competent career woman.

This depiction of the figure of Lilis can be used as a reference for high school students that a woman also has the same competence in the career field like a man. As we know, high school students need various career descriptions and jobs that they can do in the future. The depiction of the figure of Lilis who can apply as a manager in a company is expected to be able to motivate high school students to have the same motivation that they have the same opportunity as Lilis.

4) The Representation of Female Characters about Hobbies and Interests
Gender roles cannot be separated because they are related to society related to behavior, interests, and activities related to one's gender. For example, several things are closely related to gender stereotypes for no reason. For example, music and singing may be associated with female hobbies and interests. through two English books for JHS and SHS English textbooks that were analyzed there is an overrepresentation of female characters in some activities.

As seen in Fig 6, the stereotypical representation of female characters can be observed in both figures. In the first figure (left) are the discourses of female instructions accompanied by a stimulus for students to sing a song with the title “What A Wonderful World”. This instruction came from the JHS ELT textbook for grade seven. The students were asked to sing the song repeat after the teacher. Not only in the JHS ELT textbooks singing is associated as a women's hobby, but this thing also appears in the SHS ELT textbook for the twelve grade. On page 149 in the SHS ELT textbook for twelve grade, there is a picture of one of the famous female singers singing and holding a microphone. She seems to enjoy singing. This picture indicates that women always love to sing. These pictures also support the statement of Berk (2012) stated that hobbies and interests are never gender-neutral. Hobbies and interests cannot be separated since these can not be separated from gender stereotypes that contribute to society's relation to behaviors, interests, and activities pertinent to one's sex.

Besides singing, there are some hobbies and interests that can be associated with gender stereotypes related. As represented in figure 7, it indicates that not only singing and music that associated with the female-dominated hobby. In figure 7 from both JSH (grade 7 and 9) ELT textbook, making handicrafts and cooking are also still associated as female hobbies and interests.
As we can see in the instruction and conversation on the first picture (on the left side) it shows that Siti has just made a beautiful handicraft from pandan leaf for a national competition. The description in the picture showed that making handicrafts was one of Siti's interests so she even succeeded in participating in national competitions. Siti seems very passionate about handicrafts by the time Beni also looked praised her handicraft that looked so beautiful. This can show that women tend to be persistent in their interests.

The right pictures also showed another gender stereotype of female free-time activity. It described cooking as one of the female interests and hobbies in the textbook. The stereotype can be seen in the female character that gives cooking recipes. The female character instructs how to make Novel Apple Pudding (pudding apel) and an Ice fruit cocktail with condensed milk (es teler). The middle picture also showed cooking as a gendered interest. It can be seen in the conversation between Lina and her mom. In the conversation, Lina seems like enjoying mixing flour and the eggs for the pastry while Beni is calling. This thing can be associated with a female-dominated hobby by the time the female character is a representative role who gives the recipes.
Meanwhile, the SHS ELT textbook shows more various types of female representation of hobbies and interests. It can be seen in the picture below. In the picture, there is a female student who seems smiling while reading a book in the school library. We can assume that reading a book is that female student’s interest because she is smiling and enjoying her book.

Women are also stereotyped have an interest in fashion. As depicted in the pictures below, in both pictures two women complement each other's clothes. Women dressing colorfully and fashionably (in yellow and black, red and white-waist-band, brown and yellow, also white long dress) with fashionable hairstyles (straight and curly hair falling on their shoulders and straight hair bundled in a rubber band) depict that they love in the way they dressed.

D. DISCUSSION

Based on the data of analysis there are some important findings to discuss on the portrayal of women in the ELT textbooks for JHS and SHS. Occurrences of female and male characters in texts and illustrations in JHS and SHS textbooks show that the proportion of female characters in JHS textbook is higher than in SHS English textbook. The quantitative result also showed that there is imbalanced visibility of males and females in both English textbook for Junior High School and Senior High School.
The fact that language in the textbook contains gender bias plays an important role as “an ideology maker and social role determiner” (Söylemez, 2010), it can lead to the generalization of the roles of the sexes in a community. Therefore, as agents of ideology making and social role determination, the authors and users of the textbook should critically acknowledge gender equality in the textbook, the classroom, and the larger discourses of culture.

In terms of textual and visual representation, gender stereotypes and gender bias are often found in the JHS ELT textbooks rather than in the SHS ELT textbooks. It is illustrated by the depiction of women both in text and in images that are depicted as having a limited social role in both ELT textbooks that are used in this research. It was similar to Ariyanto (2018) who also found that gender bias occurred in the JHS ELT textbook for seventh. Biased representation of both genders could negatively affect learners. Foroutan (2012) if there are gender inequalities in textbooks that are authored and simulated by students, they will likely be socialized into various gender roles, resulting in the perpetuation of inequalities and bias against women.

In the context of family context women are still portrayed stereotypically by doing several domestic jobs such as cooking, cleaning, and nurturing jobs in the ELT textbooks for JHS women are still portrayed as having limited roles in the social role such as family, occupations, hobbies, and interests. Meanwhile, in the SHS ELT textbooks, women are portrayed as more professional and having a lot of achievements in various fields. The portrayal of women that is opposite to women stereotype in the society in the SHS ELT textbooks can be a good thing because it can be used to enhance SHS students to see a different perspective from the social stereotypes. It can enhance their insight that many things can be done by women, not just doing a domestic job but that women can also work professionally in their respective fields. Overall, this gender-based social analysis of the textbook showcases gender bias. However, since the textbook is currently used by English teachers for teaching the TL at different schools, this issue of gender bias should be considered by teachers as its users in ELT classes. The awareness of teachers regarding gender bias in the textbook is of great importance because they have power and authority in classrooms and thereby can, in Bayraktar’s (2011) language, “interrupt more, set topics, and can be indirect”.

E. CONCLUSION

Based on the finding of the study, the results show that there are some similarities and some differences between the representation of women in Junior High School and Senior High School ELT textbooks. It is important to note that only verbal and visual texts representing female characters were
analyzed. It was found that there is some difference between occurrences of female and male characters in the texts and illustrations in Junior High School and Senior High School ELT textbooks. The proportion of male characters in Senior High School English textbooks (25%) was higher than in Junior High School English textbooks (21%). Meanwhile, the proportion of female characters in Junior High School English textbooks (29%) was higher than in Senior High School English textbooks (25%). The frequency of visual images of male representation in the Senior High School English textbooks is higher than in Junior English Textbooks than in the Senior High School English textbooks. Meanwhile, the frequency of female representation is higher in the Junior English Textbooks than in the Senior High School English textbooks. In other words, in junior high school English books there is more gender bias which is quite significant compared to Senior high school English books.

It also found that female characters are still traditionally portrayed as stereotypes in the family context in the JHS ELT textbook than in the SHS ELT textbook. Female characters are also found still portrayed as traditionally stereotyped in the family context in the JHS ELT textbook than in the SHS ELT textbook. Female characters are still portrayed socioculturally and assigned to play traditionally feminine roles, such as doing domestic chores in the kitchen and doing domestic-job related.

In the context of social role female’s activity, role, and occupation in professional aspect are more varied in the SHS ELT textbooks than in Junior High School ELT textbooks. In the Junior High School ELT, textboofemalesale is tend to represent work in jobs that involve patience, nurturing, service, and support such as housewife, teacher, school principal, and surgeon. On the other hand, the ELT Senior High School textbooks represented various professional occupations in the textbooks such as Mayor and professional singer. Females are also stereotyped as performing very well in school both in the JHS ELT textbook and SHS ELT textbook. They are also described as having a lot of accomplishments in the professional field in the SHS ELT textbook than in the JHS ELT textbook as expected to be able to motivate high school students to have the same motivation. In the JHS ELT textbooks, females are also stereotyped as having talent in singing, cooking, and making handicraftsraft. Meanwhile in the SHS ELT textbooks, female described has many hobbies and interests such as reading, fashion, etc. Thus, although the textbook writers demonstrate their awareness of gender equality, gendered stereotypes in the textbooks persist.
References


