AN INNOVATIVE METHOD TO IMPROVE TEACHERS' CONSIDERATION REGARDING QUALITY OF ONLINE LEARNING USING REFLECTIVE THINKING

Gede Arya Sudarsana, I Putu Ngurah Wage Myartawan, Luh Gede Eka Wahyuni
Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris-Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha-Kota Singaraja-Indonesia

Abstrak

Studi deskriptif ini menginvestigasi bagaimana guru bahasa Inggris mempersepsikan diri mereka sebagai praktisi pemikiran reflektif selama pembelajaran online. Dua guru bahasa Inggris di SMAN 1 Sukasada yang telah mengajar selama hampir sepuluh tahun menanggapi kuesioner skala keterampilan mengajar reflektif yang berisi 20 pernyataan. Hasil data menunjukkan bahwa guru bahasa Inggris di SMAN 1 Sukasada mempersepsikan dirinya sebagai guru reflektif tingkat lanjut di kelas online. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa guru bahasa Inggris berada pada tingkat lanjut dalam berpikir reflektif. Karena studi ini hanya berfokus pada mendeskripsikan bagaimana mereka mempersepsikan diri mereka sendiri, studi lebih lanjut yang menjelaskan bagaimana mereka merefleksikan proses belajar mengajar mereka dalam tindakan nyata diperlukan untuk dilakukan.

Abstract

This descriptive study investigated how English teachers perceived themselves as reflective thinking practitioners during online learning. Two English teachers in SMAN 1 Sukasada who have been teaching for almost ten years responded to the reflective teaching skill scale questionnaire containing 20 statements. The data result showed that the English teacher at SMAN 1 Sukasada perceived themselves as advanced reflective teachers in the online classroom. The result indicates that the English teachers in an advanced level of reflective thinking. As this study only focused on describing how they perceived themselves, further study explaining how they reflect on their teaching and learning process in actual action is needed to carry out.

Corresponding author : Gede Arya Sudarsana
Address: Jl. Jelatik Gingsir 13, Singaraja, Bali
Instansi: Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha
E-mail: aryasudarsana52@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

Teachers play an essential role in education to help their students achieve their students' learning goals. Teachers are the spearhead in determining the quality of education. Teacher performance directly affects the quality of education of each student (Lonto, 2016). Ali et al. (2017) stated that one of the factors that led to increased student achievement was the teacher. Through Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 14 Tahun 2005 tentang Guru dan Dosen, the Indonesian government has a responsibility to educate, teach, guide, train, assess, and evaluate their students during the learning process. According to this regulation, the teachers have three primary responsibilities; planning, implementation, and evaluating. These three responsibilities must be followed to become a professional.

Meierdirk (2016) states that increasing the competence and professionalism of teachers in carrying out their roles and duties can be done through reflection. The reflection itself is a common thing that teachers should do as part of their teaching and learning cycles. Rabu & Badlishah (2020) said that reflection is a natural thought process that involves investigating, examining, researching, processing, and analyzing information. Reflection is a step in how teachers feel about their teaching and learning process by looking back at it (Phelps, 2005). According to Malatji & Wadesango (2014), reflection from the preliminary learning process is a way for teachers to investigate and evaluate themselves. The teachers can perform reflection as an investigation of the previous learning process to adapt to the students' needs. In doing the reflection, teachers should assess themselves and their teaching. Critical thinking is a base for teachers to do the reflection. By thinking critically, the teachers can realize their reflective practice. Reflection and reflective practice are critical components of teacher learning and development (Cirocki & Puji, 2019).

In the current online learning situation where both teachers and students should accustom themselves to utilize the technology in their teaching and learning process, the teachers must reflect on their teaching. The impact of the spread of the Covid-19 virus on the world of education requires educators and students to adapt to existing changes quickly. The learning system, which was initially based on face-to-face in the classroom, must be replaced by an integrated learning system through virtual internet networks or online learning (Ningsih, 2020). Through *Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Nomor 22 Tahun 2016*, the teachers are recommended to reflect after the learning process to know the weakness before and improve it. In this current situation, almost all schools carry out an online learning process to prevent the spread of COVID-19.

One school that implements this online learning process is SMAN 1 Sukasada. Based on the preliminary observation in SMAN 1 Sukasada, all the English teachers must do two things; conducting the teaching and learning process online and reporting its effectiveness. The learning process was mainly conducted through WhatsApp and Google Classroom. The virtual meeting was undertaken rarely due to some personal obstacles. The teachers did reflection-on-action once and after conducting the learning process. They also took peer observation and asked their colleagues to evaluate their teaching process. They also made a diary or a note that recorded what happened during the lesson and used it for self-evaluation. Based on the phenomenon above, the English teacher at SMAN 1 Sukasada already knew that reflection is essential for them and their students.

Teachers can make changes by reflecting on the learning process to develop self-understanding concepts and improve self-quality or professionalism in the classroom (Meierdirk, 2016). Reflect on their teaching results and determine what can be improved as a fundamental component of teacher professionalism to enhance the learning process and teacher professional practice (Sellars, 2012). Habib (2017) also mentions that the key to successful learning for both teachers and

learners is reflection. Once the teachers are advanced in doing the reflection, they can learn to activate the self-professional awareness process during their teaching. In this way, they can make good contact with students (Taylor, 2006).

Dewey (2012) mentions that reflective teachers dedicate their time to evaluate their teaching practice to improve their teaching practice. Teachers are encouraged by reflective practice to understand their learners. In short, it can be said that reflection is the key to successful learning both for teachers and learners (Habib, 2017). Shermis (1999), as cited in Choy & Oo (2012), states that the teachers who do reflective practice would follow approaches to solve their issues and encourage the students to think critically. One of the essential processes in teacher education is reflective teaching practice reflection (Zahid & Khanam, 2019). The teachers use reflective thinking to understand the effects on their students (C. Choy & Oo, 2012). Reflective thinking skills are most commonly developed during higher education and development. Modern education aims to develop reflective thinking skills (Hindrasti, 2020). It can be seen how English teachers perceive themselves as a reflective practitioners, and directly, it can be seen how they do their reflection on teaching and learning activity.

Pham et al. (2020) reflective thinking is frequently confused with critical thinking; however, reflective thinking focuses more on how students participate in making decisions and expressing their own opinions about what has occurred. There is no research conducted yet for high English school teachers in Buleleng Bali. Thus, it is considered to investigate English teachers' reflective thinking practice during online learning.

According to Choy & Oo (2012), teachers who are experts in reflective thinking have skills in understanding and implementing; first, long-life learning skills, where teachers can conduct assessments continuously. The second is self-assess ability, where teachers can assess their strengths and weaknesses. The third is self-awareness abilities, where teachers are aware of the impact of learning on students. The last ability is self-belief, which refers to a teacher's confidence in the results of their reflections in terms of improving student quality.

Long-life Learning Skills

Lifelong learning can be defined as a teaching and learning process that enables students or teachers to act and plan for lifelong learning (Daggol, 2017). Williams (2021) also mentioned that the ability to reflect on actions to engage in continuous learning and self-development using practical values and theories that can inform these practices is defined as reflective thinking practice. Lifelong learning skills are also included in the teacher's ability to continuously evaluate, assess, and reflect on their teaching strategies. Choy et al. (2017) mentioned that reflective teachers could offer students lifelong learning opportunities and engage students in active learning. Hamilton (2005) stated that developing long-life learning skills among teachers can be seen through the ability of teachers to build student identity as learners, how they can transfer learning to other contexts. They understand that reflection is a lifelong learning process.

Self-assess Ability

The ability to do self-assess among teachers can be categorized as reflective thinking on previous experiences. Self-assess allows the teachers to be more reflective of their teaching and improve it (Choy et al., 2017). Hamilton (2005) classified teachers self-assess ability categories, including how they observe their teaching performance, how they use feedback from their students, find and analyze their students, and evaluate it. For reflective teachers, conducting self-assess can be demonstrated by observing their performance first and improving their teaching weaknesses.

Self-awareness Ability

Teaching awareness is awareness of how a person learns and how reflective a teacher is. Choy et al. (2017) mentioned that teaching awareness could be interpreted as the ability of teachers to show their influence on students; this is also related to the way teachers connect experiences with reflective thinking. Reflective

thinking is the foundation for increasing teacher awareness in the classroom, which then serves as a tool for determining student needs. By doing this reflection, teachers can improve their teaching awareness, thereby giving rise to encouragement for self-assess and self-evaluation in themselves (Farrell, 2016).

Self-belief Ability

Self-belief reflects the teacher's reflective thinking can be realized by how teachers learn their teaching abilities. Choy et al. (2017) stated teacher belief in the classroom is influenced by two factors: having a more personal experience and teaching different subject matter. Therefore, teachers need reflective thinking skills to perceive themselves in the teaching and learning process to students. As mentioned by Hamilton (2005), teacher belief and self-efficacy can be seen through the three levels of teacher reflective thinking. An introductory reflective teacher is a place where teachers pay attention to their needs before they pay attention to the needs of students. Intermediate reflective teachers showing self-belief and self-efficacy are places where they can perceive their self-belief and offer good performance to students. Advanced reflective teachers can pay attention to their teaching strategies concerning students in this pandemic situation.

METHOD

This research used qualitative descriptive research. According to Sandelowsky (2000), qualitative descriptive is the method of choice when explicit descriptions of the phenomenon are desired. Such studies are beneficial for researchers looking to see who, what, and where it happened. In this study, a qualitative descriptive approach was used because the researcher wanted to describe the current phenomenon in detail, namely how the teacher's reflective thinking ability during the learning process was brave. The respondent of this study were 2 English teachers at SMAN 1 Sukasada took part as the respondents to filled the questionnaire and interviewed. They have been teaching there for over five years. Reflective

Thinking Questionnaire was used completed by the English teachers.

Reflective Thinking Questionnaire meets the reasonable instrument requirement so that can be used to assess teacher reflective thinking skill (Sabekti et al., 2020). The questionnaire was asked to rate on a scale of 1 – 5. This scale will show how English teachers perceived their reflective thinking during online teaching. Reflective thinking can be assessed by several theories from Choy & Oo, Choy, Yim & Tan, and Hamilton. The questionnaire given to the respondents was in the form of google form consisting of 20 questions related. The respondents were asked to fill the google form based on their experience in doing reflective thinking practice during online learning.

After the data obtained, the following procedure was data analysis. Data collected through questionnaire techniques First, questionnaire data from all subjects will be transcribed into one table. Then, quantitative calculations will be carried out to get the percentage of the English teacher's reflective thinking ability. The percentage will then be compared with the reflective thinking ability category table. The table for these categories can be seen in table 1.

Table 1 Criteria reflective thinking skills for English teachers adapted (Sugiyono, 2015).

Formula	Score	Criteria	Reflective Thinking Criteria
76 ≥60 + 1,5 (20)	90	Excellent	Advanced Reflective Thinking Teacher
60+0.5 (20) ≤76<60+1.5 (20)	90-70	Good	
60-0.5 (20) ≤76 < 60+0.5 (20)	70-50	Sufficient	Intermediate Reflective Thinking Teacher
60-1.5 (20) ≤76 <60-0.5 (20)	50-30	Poor	Introductory Reflective Thinking Teacher
76<60-1,5 (20)	30	Very Poor	

RESULT

Teachers' Perceived Knowledge of Reflective Thinking Implementation in Online Learning

The responses of the English teachers to the 20 statements given were gathered through a self-rated questionnaire. Each of the statements contained four reflective thinking skills to practice with the Five-Likert scale, such as Always (5), Often (4), Sometimes (3), Rarely (2), and Never (1). The result of the questionnaire is shown in table 2.

Table 2 shows that T1 perceived that she was good in reflecting on her teaching and learning process during online learning with a total score of 81%. Then T2 perceived that she was good at reflecting on his teaching and learning process during online learning with a total score of 71%. Generally, according to the two English teachers, it can be inferred that they perceived themselves as good enough in doing reflection during online learning with an average score of 76%.

Table 2 Result of Teachers' Perceived Knowledge of Their Reflective Thinking Practice

Skills	Statements	T1	T2
Life-long Learning Skill	S1	5	4
	S2	4	3
	S3	5	4
	S4	5	4
	S5	4	3
	S6	5	3
	S7	5	3
Self-Assess Ability	S8	2	2
	S9	4	4
	S10	4	3
	S11	5	4
Self-Belief	S12	5	4
	S13	4	3
	S14	5	5
	S15	1	1
Teaching Awareness	S16	4	4
	S17	4	4
	S18	4	4
	S19	1	5
	S20	5	4
	Total Point	**81**	**71**
	Percentage	**81%**	**71%**
	Total Score	**76%**	

According to this perceived knowledge, the English teachers in SMAN 1 Sukasada are classified as **advanced** teachers in implementing their reflective thinking.

DISCUSSION

Regarding implementing life-long learning skills, T1 and T2 perceived that they needed to find appropriate strategies to teach them. The teachers also needed to find inspiration from the other teachers related to how they are more innovative in teaching. It is supported by Utami (2020) that teachers must be resourceful in their material selection and able to stimulate students' interest. Burbank et al. (2012) stated that teachers needed to analyze the strategies for teaching and the problem dealing with reflection. Then, think critically about those problems can make them reflective teachers and better teachers in the future. Rianingsih (2015) says that teachers have to choose the appropriate strategy for the students with different quantity and quality to understand the content. The learning process must be modified (Sabekti et al., 2020). Thus, improving teachers' metacognitive awareness, which they own, can be a strategy for them to demonstrate their reflective thinking to students to enhance their lifelong learning skills (Adadan & Oner, 2018).

Afterward, the English teachers also perceived that they needed to evaluate themselves to be more effective in teaching practice. They required feedback from their students and colleagues to reflect on themselves and be a better teacher in the future. The feedback from students and colleagues can be used as a reflection tool because it provides helpful information from the perspectives of students and colleagues for comparing performance to expectations (Hattie & Timperley, 2007). Iqbal et al. (2016) also strengthened these findings. They mentioned that students' feedback is an essential source for improving the practicum. It also allows prospective teachers to evaluate their teaching directly. In line with Burniske & Meibaum (2012), they stated that teachers might improve their teaching and learning environment by

properly utilizing student feedback as cited in (Iqbal et al., 2016). Norton (1994), as mentioned in Balta (2018), states that teachers reflectively think when they consider the observations from others and the feedback were given by them during specific evaluations to be actively planned for future purposes.

Then, in terms of integrating their past experiences into their current teaching practice for better preparation, Kuswandono (2012) also mentioned that reflective teachers typically use their previous pedagogical experiences to enhance their teaching capacity in the future, avoiding the thoughtless routines that characterize teaching. It also supported by Choy et al. (2017) said that the integration of teachers' previous experience is seen as a critical cycle that teachers must follow for them to be able to engage students with appropriate learning strategies and conduct independent evaluations of teaching and learning strategies, the results of which will influence students' achievement.

Relating to teachers' self-belief, the teachers perceived that they could take care of their needs as a teacher before transferring the knowledge to the students. They also try to connect their life experience with the material. It is in line with the study conducted by (Choy & Oo, 2012) that stated the teachers need to take care of their own need first, (Choy, 2012) also mentioned that many of the teachers were unaware of the importance of developing this identity and how it might affect how they taught. The way a teacher teaches in the classroom is influenced by self-confidence, perceptions of teaching abilities, and relationships with students (Williams, 2021). The reflective teachers must adequately prepare themselves for teaching practice by integrating their previous experiences, taking into account student feedback. Their colleagues thought of their teaching practice to be responsible for providing students with the necessary learning materials in class (Rianingsih, 2015). Chee Choy et al. (2019) also supported this finding by stating that teachers must first prepare themselves to understand the material before transferring

knowledge to students. The reflective practice is an essential part of the meaning-making process for both students and teachers.

The English teacher in SMAN 1 Sukasada perceived that they tried to identify the connecting areas between what and how they teach with their life experiences. Teachers with more experience and used in the teaching process have been more reflective. They have a deeper understanding of teaching than teachers with less experienced (Mirzaei et al., 2014). Reflective teaching competencies and skills gained through practice and experienced. Furthermore, (Choy et al., 2017) stated that self-belief is how teachers see themselves about their students and their ability to teach. In line with Chen (2012), this finding mentioned that teachers might be unaware of the effect or the outcomes of the learning practices in the learning without knowing how their students feel about the learning process.

Regarding about skill of teachers' teaching awareness, the teachers perceived that they think about what they teach to improve their teaching. It can be known their students' feedback and the characteristics of the students. The teachers have a similar thought about how they tried to think about what they teach their students in terms of their area of discipline to improve their teaching. Being aware of students' characteristics and their needs helps teachers understand how to improve the teaching and learning quality (Hill & Chin, 2018). They also needed to set the way they teach as comfortable as possible. They believed that their self-quality was influenced by their self-belief (Wongwanich et al., 2014).

In line with Yildirim (2017) mentioned that no matter how experienced they are in their field or teaching method, if teachers are unaware of their practical mistakes, they will not be aware of the steps necessary to prevent them. They need to doing that kind of reflection to improve the weakness in their teaching practices. It is also strengthened by Yildirim (2017) said that teachers could question what they do, restructure it, and put these changes into practice to improve

their teaching. It is also supported by Choy et al. (2017). Since teaching awareness refers to a teacher's ability to release their role toward students, the reflective practice should be preceded by understanding previous experiences.

Regarding the result of the teachers' perceived knowledge of their reflective thinking practice, which had been presented, the English teachers had expressed a positive effect of perceived understanding of their reflective thinking practice. It was indicated by a high score of the questionnaire result. The final score 76%, and it can be shown that the English teachers at SMAN 1 Sukasada have good criteria by looking at four skills in reflective teaching. It can be stated that they are at an advanced level. However, to establish an effective teaching and learning process for students, English teachers must possess reflective thinking skills, especially in this online learning situation (Choy et al., 2017). In line with (Orakci, 2021) mentioned that reflective thinking is seen as a critical process for teachers' ability to keep up with developments in educational science, implement what they have learned, and track their progress in light of scientific knowledge and experiences.

CONCLUSION

To sum it, this study's finding investigated that the English teachers at SMAN 1 Sukasada have realized the importance of reflection. Therefore, they know that by practicing reflection to find their strengths and weaknesses in teaching and continue improving their teaching process, they must engage in the practice of reflection. When they realized how important it was to do this reflection, they did various things, including asking students for feedback on the teaching process and asking other teachers to rate the way they taught. They do everything they can to improve their teaching process, enhancing the learning process outcomes. It is indicated that they are aware of and enjoyable with their reflective practice.

Furthermore, even though English teachers' reflective thinking is classified as advanced, some issues need to be addressed during practice in an online learning process. In addition of this study cannot be generalized because this study has a limited scale in the subject and collecting the data. Therefore, further studies need to be conducted to see how the teachers carried out reflection practice.

REFERENCES

Abdul Rabu, S. N., & Badlishah, N. S. (2020). Levels of Students' Reflective Thinking Skills in a Collaborative Learning Environment Using Google Docs. *TechTrends*, *64*(3), 533–541. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11528-020-00504-5

Adadan, E., & Oner, D. (2018). Examining preservice teachers' reflective thinking skills in the context of web-based portfolios: The role of metacognitive awareness. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, *43*(11), 26–50. https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2018v43n11.2

Ali, M., Setyosari, P., Dwijogo, W. D., & Napitupulu, M. (2017). Hubungan Antara Persepsi Siswa Terhadap Kompetensi Guru, Konsep Diri, Sikap, Dan Hasil Belajar Matematika Siswa Di Sma Kota Palu. *JINOTEP (Jurnal Inovasi Dan Teknologi Pembelajaran) Kajian Dan Riset Dalam Teknologi Pembelajaran*, *1*(2), 165–181.

Balta, E. E. (2018). Reflective thinking tendencies and epistemological beliefs in terms of learning styles. *International Journal of Higher Education*, *7*(6), 106–117. https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v7n6p106

Burbank, M., Bates, A., & Ramirez, L. (2012). Critically reflective thinking in urban teacher education : A comparative case study of two participants' experiences as content area teachers. *The Professional Educator*, *36*(2), 1–17.

Chee Choy, S., Lee, M. Y., & Sedhu, D. S. (2019). Reflective thinking among teachers: Development and preliminary validation of reflective thinking for teachers questionnaire. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, *65*(1), 37–50.

Choy, C., & Oo, P. S. (2012). Reflective Thinking and Teaching Practices: a Precursor for Incorporating Critical Thinking Into the Classroom? *International Journal of Instruction*, *5*(1), 167–182.

Choy, C., Yim, J. S. C., & Tan, P. L. (2017). Reflective thinking among preservice teachers: A Malaysian perspective. *Issues in Educational Research*, *27*(2), 234–251.

Choy, S. C. (2012). Reflective Thinking and Teaching Practices: a Precursor for Incorporating Critical Thinking Into the Classroom? *International Journal of*

Instruction, *5*(1), 167–182.

Cirocki, A., & Puji, H. (2019). Reflective Practice in English Language Teaching in Indonesia: Shared Practices from Two Teacher Educators. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research*, *7*(3), 15–35.

Daggol, G. D. (2017). Lifelong Learning: Not a 21St Century, But an Omnitemporal Skill. *International Journal of Social Humanities Sciences Research (JSHSR)*, *4*(12), 1254–1267. https://doi.org/10.26450/jshsr.207

Dewey, J. (2012). How we think we think. In *Teachers College Record* (Vol. 114, Issue 2).

Farrell, T. S. C. (2016). Surviving the transition shock in the first year of teaching through reflective practice. *System*, *61*, 12–19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2016.07.005

Habib, H. (2017). A study of reflective practice and its role for teachers. *International Journal of Creative Research Thoughts (IJCRT)*, *5*(4), 944–947.

Hamilton, S. J. (2005). *Areas of Development Development in Reflective Thinking Introductory Intermediate*. 2005.

Hattie, J., & Timperley, H. (2007). The power of feedback. *Review of Educational Research*, *77*(1), 81–112. https://doi.org/10.3102/003465430298487

Hill, H. C., & Chin, M. (2018). Connections Between Teachers' Knowledge of Students, Instruction, and Achievement Outcomes. *American Educational Research Journal*, *55*(5), 1076–1112. https://doi.org/10.3102/0002831218769614

Hindrasti, N. E. K. (2020). The reflective thinking skills of preservice biology teacher in histology lectures. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1470*(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1470/1/012080

Iqbal, M. Z., Ramzan, M., & Arain, A. A. (2016). Students' Feedback: A Stimulus Reflective Practice for Professional Development of the Prospective Teachers. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, *10*(1), 69–79.

Kuswandono, P. (2012). Reflective Practices for Teacher Education. *Language and Language Teaching Journal*, *15*(01), 149–162. https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.2012.150102

Lonto, A. L. (2016). Pengaruh Kecerdasan Emosional dan Lingkungan Keluarga Terhadap Kinerja Guru Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan SMA di Sulawesi Utara. *JINOTEP (Jurnal Inovasi Teknologi Pembelajaran)*, *1*(4), 313–322.

Malatji, K. S., & Wadesango, N. (2014). *Self-reflection as a Tool to Improve Teaching Practice : The Practice and the Timing of Self-reflection by Primary Schools Teachers in the Mankweng Circuit , Capricorn District*. *41*(3), 375–383.

Meierdirk, C. (2016). *The Changing Identity of the Student Teacher*. *1*(1).

Mirzaei, F., Phang, F. A., & Kashefi, H. (2014). Assessing and Improving Reflective Thinking of Experienced and Inexperienced Teachers. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *141*, 633–639. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.05.111

Ningsih, S. (2020). Persepsi Mahasiswa Terhadap Pembelajaran Daring Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *JINOTEP (Jurnal Inovasi Dan Teknologi Pembelajaran): Kajian Dan Riset Dalam Teknologi Pembelajaran*, *7*(2), 124–132. https://doi.org/10.17977/um031v7i22020p124

Orakci, S. (2021). Teachers ' Reflection and Level of Reflective Thinking on the Different Dimensions of their teaching practice. *International Journal of Modern Education Studies*, *5*(1), 0–3. https://doi.org/10.51383/ijonmes.2021.88

Pham, T. N., Lin, M., Trinh, V. Q., & Bui, L. T. P. (2020). Electronic Peer Feedback, EFL Academic Writing and Reflective Thinking: Evidence From a Confucian Context. *SAGE Open*, *10*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020914554

Phelps, R. (2005). The Potential of Reflective Journals in Studying Complexity "In Action." *Complicity: An International Journal of Complexity and Education*, *2*(1). https://doi.org/10.29173/cmplct8726

Rianingsih, R. (2015). *The Teachers Strategies in Overcoming Students' Difficulties in Speaking at English Intensive Program of MA An-Nur Cirebon* (Issue 14111320123).

Sabekti, A. W., Khoirunnisa, F., & Liliasari, L. (2020). *Validating the Indonesian Version of Reflective Thinking Questionnaire and Investigation of the Relationship Between Pre-Service Teachers' Reflective Thinking and Academic Achievement*. 138–144. https://doi.org/10.24071/seadr.2019.19

Sellars, M. (2012). Teachers and change : The role of reflective practice. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *55*, 461–469. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.525

Sugiyono. (2015). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan (Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D)*.

Taylor, L. (2006). *Reflecting on Teaching the benefits of self-evaluation* (pp. 109–122). Queensland University of Technology.

Utami, T. P. (2020). *An Analysis of Teachers' Strategies on English E-Learning Classes During COVID-19 Pandemic*. State Institute for Islamic Studies.

Williams, P. (2021). Reflective Thinking Practices among Pre-service Teachers : Comparison between Malaysia and Australia Reflective

Thinking Practices Among Pre-Service Teachers : Comparison. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, *46*(2).

Wongwanich, S., Sakolrak, S., & Piromsombat, C. (2014). Needs for Thai Teachers to Become a Reflective Teacher: Mixed Methods Needs Assessment Research. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *116*, 1645–1650. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.01.450

Yildirim, T. (2017). An Examination of Geography Teachers ' Reflective Thinking Tendencies. *International Journal of Higher Education*, *6*(6), 78–90. https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v6n6p78

Zahid, M., & Khanam, A. (2019). Effect of Reflective Teaching Practices on the Performance of Prospective Teachers. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology - TOJET*, *18*(1), 32–43.